

Economic Sociology: What Counts?

David Stark
Fall 2004
Sociology 8200
Graduate seminar
Department of Sociology
Columbia University
seminar meeting : Tues. 6:10-8:00 pm
office hours: Wed. 2-4 pm
tel: 212-854-3972
424 Fayerweather Hall

dcs36@columbia.edu

<http://www.sociology.columbia.edu/people/faculty/stark/index.html>

Rationale: This course questions the disciplinary division of labor in which economists study value and sociologists study values; and it rejects the pact whereby economists study the economy and sociologists study social relations in which they are embedded. Through their critical reading, engaged discussion, and research papers, graduate students in this course will be contributing to the development of sociology of worth.

Faced with a deluge of information, a multiplicity of evaluative principles, and myriad features that could be potentially salient, what is taken into account? What matters, who counts, and with what kinds of measures and metrics? In examining how actors navigate multiple orders of worth we will be especially interested in the socio-technologies of making and taking accounts. Because tools count as constitutive parts of the social, they must be brought into our accounts. Tools – instruments, artifacts, numbering systems, spreadsheets, microphones, monitors, servers, protocols, platforms, podiums, flipcharts, websites, power points, algorithms, maps, models, tabulators, tables – are a part not only of calculative practices but also of public assemblages in politics and civic life.

Organization: We will definitely cover the first part of the course. We might choose from among the selected topics in Part II, or (preferred) move to discussion of student papers.

Requirements: Informed participation in each weekly seminar is expected of every student in the course. To prepare for the discussions, write a short essay (2 pages) on the readings for each week and bring it to the seminar. The major requirement for the course is a research paper. You should begin working on your paper already during the first weeks of the course. You'll be asked to make a brief presentation about your research.

The topic and the format of the final paper are your choice, in consultation with the instructor. Our mutual goal is to find a topic and means of presentation that best meets your needs.

Readings: Books are available at Labyrinth Books, 112th street between Amsterdam and Broadway.

PART I

* required readings

Introduction First class meeting September 7th

A. Orders of Worth

* Luc Boltanski and Laurent Thevenot, "[The Sociology of Critical Capacity](#)," *European Journal of Social Theory* 1999 2(3):359-377.

* David Stark, "[For a Sociology of Worth](#)." Keynote address, European Association of Evolutionary Political Economy, Berlin, November, 2000.

* David Stark, "[Work, Worth, and Justice](#)." *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, November 1990, no.85:2-19.

And see other papers at Columbia University, Center on Organizational Innovation, <http://www.coi.columbia.edu/workingpapers.html>

Laurent Thevenot, "Conventions of Co-ordination and the Framing of Uncertainty." In E. Fullbrook, *Intersubjectivity in Economics*. Routledge, 2002, pp. 181-197.

Laurent Thevenot, "The French convention school and the coordination of economic action." (interview by Soren Jagd) [Economic Sociology: European Electronic Newsletter vol 5, no. 3, June 2004](#).

Nicolas Dodier, "Action as a Combination of 'Common Worlds,'" *Sociological Review*, 1993, 556-571.

Luc Boltanski and Laurent Thevenot, *De la Justification: Les economies de la grandeur*. Paris: Galliard, 1991.

B. Distributed Cognition

* Edwin Hutchins and T. Klausen, "[Distributed Cognition in an Airline Cockpit](#)." In Y. Engeström & D. Middleton (Eds.), *Cognition and Communication at Work*, (pp. 15-34). New York: Cambridge University Press.

* Bruno Latour, "Technology is Society Made Durable," and in John Law, ed., *A Sociology of Monsters: Essays on Power, Technology, and Domination*. Routledge, 1991, pp.103-131.

* Daniel Beunza and David Stark, "[Tools of the Trade: The Socio-Technology of Arbitrage in a Wall Street Trading Room](#)." *Industrial and Corporate Change*, 2004, 13(1):369-401.

David Lane and Robert Maxfield, "Strategy under Complexity: Fostering Generative Relationships" *Long Range Planning*, vol.29, no.2, 1996, pp.215-31.

Edwin Hutchins, *Cognition in the Wild*, MIT, 1995.

Andy Clark, "Leadership and Influence: The Manager as Coach, Nanny, and Artificial DNA." In John Clippinger, ed., *The Biology of Business: Decoding the Natural Laws of Enterprise*, Jossey-Bass: San Francisco: 1999, pp. 47-66.

Andy Clark, *Being There: Putting Brain, Body, and World Together Again*. MIT, 1997.

Roy Pea, "Practices of Distributed Intelligence and Designs for Education." In G. Salomon (Ed.), *Distributed Cognitions: Psychological and Educational Considerations*, (pp. 47-87). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Bruno Latour, *The Pasteurization of France*. Harvard University Press 1988.

Bruno Latour, *Science in Action: How to Follow Scientists and Engineers Through Society*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. [Chapter 3, pp.103-144]

John Law, "Technology and Heterogeneous Engineering: The Case of Portuguese Expansion," in W.E.Bjiker, T.P.Hughes, and T.J.Pinch (eds) *The Social Construction of Technical Systems: New Directions In The Sociology And History Of Technology*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1989, pp. 111-134.

C. Too many choices?

* Sheena Iyengar and Mark Lepper, "When choice is demotivating: Can one desire too much of a good thing?" *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 2000 79(6): 995-1006.

Sheena Iyengar and Wei Jiang, "Choosing Not to Choose: The Effect of More Choices on Retirement Savings Decisions." Manuscript, Columbia Business School.

* Richard H. Thaler, "Mental Accounting Matters," *Journal of Behavioral Decision Making* 1999 12:183-206.

Barry Schwartz, *The Paradox of Choice*. New York: HarperCollins. 2004.

D. Attachment

* Michel Callon, Cecile Meadel and Vololona Rabeharisoa, "The economy of qualities." *Economy and Society* May 2002 31(2):194-217.

* Michel Callon and Fabian Muniesa, "Economic markets as calculative and calculated collective devices." New York Conference on Social Studies of Finance, Columbia University, May 2002. www.coi.columbia.edu/sf/papers/callon-muniesa.doc

E. Performativity

* Donald MacKenzie and Yuval Millo, "Constructing a Market, Performing Theory: The Historical Sociology of a Financial Derivatives Exchange." *AJS* July 2003 109(1):107-145.

* Michel Callon, "The Embeddedness of economic markets in economics." In Michel Callon, ed. *The Laws of the Markets*. Blackwell, 1998, pp. 1-57.

F. Performance

* Antoine Hennion, "[Baroque and rock: Music, mediators and musical taste.](#)" *Poetics* 24 (1997): 415-435.

* Antoine Hennion, "The Pragmatics of Taste." *The Blackwell Companion to the Sociology of Culture*. Mark Jacobs, Nancy Hanrahan eds, Oxford UK/Malden MA, Blackwell, 2004

G. Categories

* Greta Hsu and Joel Podolny, "Critiquing the Critics: An Approach for the Comparative Evaluation of Critical Schemas."

* Daniel Beunza and Raghu Garud. "[Security Analysts as Framemakers.](#)" unpublished manuscript.

Ezra Zuckerman, "The categorical imperative: Securities analysts and the illegitimacy discount." *AJS* 1999 104(5):1398-1438.

Ezra Zuckerman, "Structural Incoherence and Stock Market Activity." *ASR* 2004, 69:405-432.

John Henry Clippinger, "What is in a Name? Information, Context, and Tags." In *The Biology of Business: Decoding the Natural Laws of Enterprise* edited by John Clippinger. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1999.

Manville, Brook. "Complex Adaptive Knowledge Management: A Case from McKinsey & Company." In *The Biology of Business: Decoding the Natural Laws of Enterprise* edited by John Clippinger. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1999.

PART II Selected Topics

Innovation through Organizational Heterogeneity

* Monique Girard and David Stark, "[Distributing Intelligence and Organizing Diversity in New Media Projects.](#)" *Environment and Planning A* vol. 34, no 11, November 2002, pp. 1927-1949.

Brown, John Seely, "Introduction: Rethinking Innovation in a Changing World," in Brown (ed.) *Seeing Differently: Insights on Innovation*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Business School Press, 1997, pp. ix-xxviii.

Harrison White, "Values Come in Styles which Mate to Change." in Michael Hechter, Lynn Nadel and Richard Michod, eds., *The Origins of Values*, New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 1993, pp. 63-91.

Arie Lewin, Chris P. Long, and Timothy N. Carroll, "The Coevolution of New Organizational Forms," *Organization Science* Sept.-Oct. 1999, 10(5):535-550.

Arie Lewin and Henk Volberda, "Prolegomena on Coevolution: A Framework for Research on Strategy and New Organizational Forms," *Organization Science* Sept.-Oct. 1999, 10(5):519-534.

Daniel Levinthal and Massimo Warglien, "Landscape Design: Designing for Local Action in Complex Worlds," *Organization Science* May-June 1999, 10(3):342-357.

Coordination without Homogenization

* John Padgett. and Christopher Ansell (1993). "Robust Action and the Rise of the Medici, 1400-1434." *American Journal of Sociology*, 98, 1259-1319.

* Peter Galison.(1997). *Image and Logic: A Material Culture of Microphysics*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. [Chapter 1, pp. 1-63, and Chapter 9 (Part II, "The Trading Zone"), pp. 803-844]

* Susan Leigh Star and James Griesemer, "Institutional Ecology, Translations, and Boundary Objects: Amateurs and Professionals in Berkeley's Museum of Vertebrate Zoology, 1907- 1939." *Social Studies of Science*, 1989, 19:387-420.

Karin Knorr Cetina, "Sociality with Objects: Social Relations in Postsocial Knowledge Societies." *Theory, Culture, and Society*, 1997 14(4):1-30.

Harrison White, "Where Do Languages Come From?—I. Switching between networks." Department of Sociology, Columbia University, manuscript.

Harrison White, "Times and Narrative out of Zaps and Ratchet," and "Social Times." Manuscripts.

Bruno Latour, "The Prince for Machines as well as for Machinations." In B. Elliott, ed. *Technology and Social Process*. Edinburg Univ. Press, 1988:20-43.
http://www.ensmp.fr/PagePerso/CSI/Bruno_Latour/

Raghu Garud and Michael Rappa "A Socio-Cognitive Model of Technology Evolution: The Case of Cochlear Implants." *Organization Science* 1994 5(3):344-362.

Michel Callon, "Tehno-economic Networks and Irreversibility," in John Law, ed. *A Sociology of Monsters: Essays on Power, Technology, and Domination*. Routledge, 1991.

John Seely Brown and Paul Duguid, "Borderline Issues: Social and Material Aspects of Design." *Human-Computer Interaction*. 1994, vol. 9:3-36.

Andrew Abbott "Things of Boundaries," *Social Research*, Winter 1995, 62(4):857-881.

Conventions

Laurent Thevenot, "Conventions of Co-ordination and the Framing of Uncertainty." In E. Fullbrook, *Intersubjectivity in Economics*. Routledge, 2002, pp. 181-197.

Laurent Thevenot, "Which road to follow? The moral complexity of an 'equipped' humanity." In John Law and Annemarie Mol, eds., *Complexities: Social Studies of Knowledge Practices*. Duke University Press, 2002, pp. 53-87.

Emmanuel Lazega and Olivier Favereau, "Introduction," *Conventions and Structures in Economic Organization: Markets, Networks, and Hierarchies*. Cheltenham UK: Edward Elgar, 2002, pp. 1-27.

Francois Eymard-Duvernay, "Conventionalist approaches to enterprise," in Lazega and Favereau, eds. pp. 60-212.

Olivier Favereau, Olivier Biencourt and Francois Eymard-Duvernay, "Where do markets come from? From (quality) conventions!" In Lazega and Favereau, eds. pp. 213-252.

Networks and Social Times

David Stark and Balazs Vedres, "[Social Times of Network Spaces: Network Sequences and Foreign Investment in Hungary](#)." *American Journal of Sociology* 111(4) January 2006.

Brian Uzzi and Jarrett Spiro, "Do Small Worlds Make a Difference: Artist networks and the success of Broadway musicals, 1945-1989. SFI conference.

Walter W. Powell, Kenneth Koput, Douglas R. White, and Jason Owen-Smith. 2002. "Network Dynamics and Field Evolution: The Growth of Interorganizational Collaboration in the Life Sciences." Stanford University, Unpublished manuscript.

Place and Innovation

* Annalee Saxenian, *Regional Advantage: Culture and Competition in Silicon Valley and Route 128*. Harvard University Press 1994.

* Gernot Grabher, "[Ecologies of Creativity: the Village, the Group, and the Heterarchic Organisation of the British Advertising Industry.](#)" In: *Environment & Planning A*, 2001 vol. 33, pp. 351-374.

Peter Galison and Caroline A. Jones "Factory, Laboratory, Studio: Dispersing Sites of Production" in *The Architecture of Science*, Peter Galison and Emily Thompson eds., MIT, 1999.

Karin Knorr Cetina and Urs Bruegger. 2002. "Global Microstructures: The Virtual Societies of Financial Markets." *American Journal of Sociology* 107(4)(January):905-50.

Peter Galison, "Time Zones: Einstein, Poincare, Simultaneity," Paper presented at the Heterarchies Seminar, Columbia University, April 3, 2000.

Malcolm Gladwell, "Designs for Working." *The New Yorker*, December 11, 2000.
http://www.gladwell.com/2000/2000_12_11_a_working.htm

Lucy Suchman, *Plans and Situated Actions*, Cambridge University Press, 1984.

Communities of Innovation

* Bruce Kogut and Anca Metiu, "Open-Source Software Development and Distributed Innovation," *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 2001 17(2): 248-264.

* Siobhan O'Mahony, "The Emergence of a New Commercial Actor: Community Managed Software Projects," unpublished manuscript.

Money and Price

* John Julius Sviokla, "Buying and Selling in the Digital Age: An Ever-Increasing Bandwidth of Desire." In John Clippinger, ed., *The Biology of Business: Decoding the Natural Laws of Enterprise*, Jossey-Bass: San Francisco: 1999, pp. 215-235.

* Neil Gershenfeld, "Smart Money," In Gershenfeld, *When Things Start to Think*. Henry Holt: New York, 1999, pp. 77-91.

* Michael Hutter, "Communication in Economic Evolution: The Case of Money," in R. England, ed., *Evolutionary Concepts in Contemporary Economics*. Ann Arbor, 1993.

